DEFINING AND DEVELOPING A LEARNING-FOCUSED FEEDBACK CULTURE

PROF NAOMI WINSTONE
N.WINSTONE@SURREY.AC.UK
It looks like feedback, but does it function as feedback?

You could also be clearer in outlining the overall argument that will be presented to address the question. I think this information is there implicitly, but you could be more focused in telling the reader what you will conclude about the extent to which the ideas of Flaggel and Vygotsky are relevant to contemporary educational practice. As it stands, your introduction tells the reader that you will answer the question, but not how.

I feel that your essay could have been better structured in a way that enabled you to integrate material, and expand upon the points that you make. There are essentially three positions to your essay: 1) a description of the theories; 2) a discussion of how the principles might apply in practice; 3) a critical evaluation of their theories. It might have made more sense to present a principle, and then evaluate its application. I think this would have made your points feel more fully developed.

The main way in which this essay could be improved is to make stronger use of research evidence. You make quite heavy use of a few sources (e.g. Blaie & Proctor, yet do not really discuss any empirical research studies. The essay briefly asked you to describe relevant research evidence and explain its relevance for your argument. I would have liked to see presentation of relevant studies, for example in your discussion of collaborative learning. Similarly, your critical evaluation would have much stronger impact if it was based on discussion of specific pieces of evidence.
Feedback as a Process


Old Paradigm
- Feedback as information
- Focus on delivery
- Students receive comments
- Cognitivist

New Paradigm
- Feedback as sense-making
- Focus on student uptake
- Students generate comments
- Social constructivist

‘processes where the learner makes sense of performance-relevant information to promote their learning’

Henderson et al. (2019, p. 17)
• Effectiveness of feedback more likely to be judged on student satisfaction than student learning (Winstone & Boud, 2019)
• Educators predominantly view their responsibility to give, and the responsibility of their students to receive, comments (Winstone, Pitt, & Nash, 2021)
• International student satisfaction surveys position students passively within feedback processes (Winstone, Ajjawi, Dirkx, & Boud, 2021)
• Transmission-focused representations of feedback continue to dominate the feedback literature (Winstone, Boud, Dawson, & Heron, 2021)
MOVING FEEDBACK FORWARDS
When you and your colleagues talk about feedback, what are the common issues that are discussed?
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Turnaround time</th>
<th>How comments should be framed</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>How to increase student engagement with feedback</td>
<td>Opportunities for formative feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>How many comments should be given</td>
<td>Format of feedback (e.g. proforma or rubric)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Using technology in feedback</td>
<td>Opportunities for students to apply and use feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring alignment between feedback and the grade awarded</td>
<td>Opportunities for peer feedback</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEFINING FEEDBACK CULTURES

‘the values and beliefs of the individuals involved and how these shape the norms and expectations for feedback interactions’

(Watling et al., 2020, p. 294)

influenced by: ‘a complex and dynamic interaction of the implicit and explicit messages about feedback to which [individuals] are exposed, their own beliefs, values and professional development, and institutional policies and procedures’

(Winstone & Boud, 2019b, p. 413)


In my department, we are all expected to give 100 words of feedback on what was done well, 100 words on what was not done well, and 100 words on how to improve. We have a shared template which we have to use, and there is a strict deadline for the return of marked work with feedback: 15 working days.
We talk about feedback with our students from the first day of the course. We want them to develop the skills to use feedback effectively, and to be able to manage their own emotional reactions. We make time in class to talk through feedback and when work has been marked we meet with students to discuss how they can apply our feedback.
Feedback is designed to support students’ learning, and to enable students to use feedback to build their skills.

Feedback processes focus on student learning, not the transmission of information.

Developments to feedback processes are informed by evidence and research.

The development of feedback processes has an enhancement rather than assurance focus.

Students have the opportunity to develop skills for using feedback effectively.

Opportunities for dialogue are built into feedback processes.

A Learning-Focused Approach

**Principle 1:** Clear and inclusive communication of assessment task requirements

**Principle 2:** Opportunities to understand and discuss assessment criteria

**Principle 3:** Timely feedback that is designed to support future work

**Principle 4:** Forward-looking comments that focus on development

**Principle 5:** Facilitating students’ use of feedback by giving feedback comments a ‘landing place’

**Principle 6:** Providing opportunities for dialogue

**CONSOLIDATION PHASE**
Supporting students’ learning after work is assessed

**PREPARATION PHASE**
Supporting students’ learning before they submit work

**ASSESSMENT PHASE**
Supporting students’ learning through the way in which work is assessed
FEEDBACK
HISTORIES
How do we learn to participate in feedback processes?
They will never give you the chance even to discuss with them anything. I remember the [lecturer] said: ‘never think that you can come and ask me for help or ask to clarify things

This thing with a written assignment with a feedback on it, I have never seen anything like this in Italy...I am not sure how to approach it, it makes me nervous

I haven’t talked to [the lecturer]. Maybe I can talk to him but...I don’t know what the system is here, but I don’t think it is like that
What we, as educators, see reflected through learners’ engagement with feedback is not only the effect of our current practice but also the influence of learners’ prior idiosyncratic feedback experiences. Therefore, when designing feedback opportunities in our course, we should acknowledge the non-homogeneity of learners’ feedback histories and not expect equal participation and engagement.

Malecka, Boud, Tai, & Ajjawi (2022, p. 1341)
What characteristics make someone ‘good’ at using feedback?
DEFINING FEEDBACK LITERACY

Knowing how to optimise the benefits of feedback opportunities

(Niemenen and Carless, 2022, p.1)

WINSTONE ET AL. (2017)

> SELF-APPRAISAL

> ASSESSMENT LITERACY

> GOAL-SETTING & SELF-REGULATION

> ENGAGEMENT & MOTIVATION

(1) Feedback guide
(2) Feedback workshop
(3) Feedback portfolio

http://tinyurl.com/DEFTtoolkit

The positioning of feedback processes within **policy and practice** as central to student learning, personal development and confidence

The creation of opportunities for teachers and students to **construct shared understandings** of the value and purpose of feedback in the context of their own disciplines

Creating an environment where the effectiveness of feedback processes is positioned as a **shared responsibility** between students and teachers, rather than being the sole responsibility of teachers

Recognition of the **time and emotional work** that goes into feedback processes, resisting the commodification of feedback through assigning fixed amounts of time to the activity

Recognition of the **value of a wide range of evidence** sources that signify the effectiveness of feedback processes, alongside resistance to focusing on simplistic measures such as student evaluation instruments

Giving teachers **time and space** to engage with scholarship and participate in dialogue to open up new ideas about how feedback processes can and should be developed

**Pitt & Winstone (2022)**

the extent to which the environment, or system, supports and enables effective feedback processes to develop and flourish.

(Pitt & Winstone, 2023, p. 153)
WHAT DO WE WANT FEEDBACK TO BE?

A burden on our time \hspace{0.5cm} \textbf{OR} \hspace{0.5cm} the part of our job where we make learning happen?

A judgment on a piece of work \hspace{0.5cm} \textbf{OR} \hspace{0.5cm} guidance for the future?

A one-off comment \hspace{0.5cm} \textbf{OR} \hspace{0.5cm} an ongoing conversation?

A process that only teachers can do \hspace{0.5cm} \textbf{OR} \hspace{0.5cm} a process that students are equally qualified to do?

A process with the potential to be powerful \hspace{0.5cm} \textbf{OR} \hspace{0.5cm} a process with visible impact?
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Images from Pixabay

Research Assistants:
Mike Parker
James Rowntree
Georgina Mathlin
Emily Papps
Jessica Bourne
Joshua Best
María Norman

https://www.surrey.ac.uk/department-higher-education/learning-lab

Funders:

[Logos of AQA, SEDA, National Teaching Fellowship Scheme, Higher Education Academy, Leverhulme Trust, and Hefce]

20% Discount
Code: FLR40